# **EVALUATION REPORT**

# **GUAM COMMUNITY COLLEGE**

Post Office Box 23069 Barrigada, Guam 96921

A Confidential Report Prepared for the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges Western Association of Schools and Colleges

This report represents the findings of the evaluation team that visited Guam Community College on February 27 – March 2, 2006

Philip L. Hartley, Ph.D. Team Chair

## **TEAM MEMBERS**

Dr. Philip Hartley (Chair)

President

West Valley College

Dr. Judith Branzburg Professor of English Pasadena City College

Dr. Daniel Castro

President

Riverside City College

Dr. Janis Caston

Dean, Instruction & Student Learning

Cosumnes River College

Dr. Sallyanne Fitzgerald Vice President of Instruction

Napa Valley College

Dr. Audrey Yamagata-Noji Vice President Student Services

Mt. San Antonio College

Ms. Brenda Rogers (Team Assistant)

Senior Executive Assistant

West Valley College

Dr. Nizam Kazi

Professor of Mathematics Mt. San Jacinto College

Ms. Suzette Robinson

Interim Dir. Continuing Ed./Training

Maui Community College

Mr. David Tom

Director of Institutional Research

West Valley College

Ms. Teresa Scott

**Executive Vice Chancellor** 

Yosemite Community College District

2

## **Summary of the Evaluation Report**

INSTITUTION: Guam Community College

DATE OF VISIT: February 27 – March 2, 2006

TEAM CHAIR: Philip L. Hartley, Ph.D.

President, West Valley College

An accreditation team composed of eleven members, each experienced in their professions and together comprising a team with great depth and breadth of experience, had the pleasure of visiting Guam Community College on February 28 through March 2, 2006 for the purpose of evaluating the institution's request to reaffirm accreditation. Guam Community College is located on the island of Guam, the largest and most developed island in Micronesia. Guam Community College is the only community college on Guam and operates as part of the executive branch of the Government of Guam. The college is governed by a seven member Board of Trustees including one voting student trustee. The Board members are appointed by the Governor of Guam.

Guam Community College was well prepared for the accreditation visit. The previsit by the team chair and assistant to the college in December was very useful in establishing the organization and logistics for the team visit, and the college had done a thorough job of arranging all necessary facilities, equipment, documents, and schedules before the team arrived. It was clear that the accreditation process and visit were important to the college, and everyone interviewed was well aware and supportive of the site visit. College personnel were friendly, open and candid in their interviews, and the consistency with which different segments of the college identified issues was helpful in formulating team recommendations.

The team found that in the case of Guam Community College, the accreditation report must be viewed as the composite of three documents provided to the team; the Reaffirmation Self Study Report (November 2005), the Fifth Annual Institutional Assessment Report (August 2005) and the Draft Institutional Strategic Master Plan (December 2005). Additionally, a multitude of information was available on the College's Assessment Website. In fact, even more information and documentation was available than communicated in the official accreditation documents. Because the documents were organized around a thematic and assessment format, team members had some difficulty relating information to specific accreditation standards and had to "mine" information to make relevant observations.

Guam Community College has the responsibility for all vocational education on the island and is proud of this historical commitment. Therefore, the college operates vocational programs taught by very dedicated Guam Community College faculty at the

each of the island's four public high schools. These programs are designed as two- to three-year programs to prepare students for the world of work upon graduation, but most of the programs do have various levels of linkage to college programs on the main campus. The college has recently moved to standardize its general education and math/English competencies in an effort to increase the viability of their transfer program. They have also added an associate degree in liberal arts and a new program in practical nursing. Both these substantive changes have been approved by the Commission within the last year.

Team members verified that the college has made impressive progress in response to the previous team's visit. In the years since the last visit, the college has created a comprehensive, ongoing assessment process which has established a culture of measurement and documentation. The team concluded that the college was well positioned to continue making progress in the development and use of student learning outcomes for courses, programs and the institution.

Guam Community College operates in the face of frequently daunting natural challenges, such as major typhoons that occasionally disrupt operations for months at a time and leave behind severe facility repair needs. The team was impressed with the faculty, staff, and administration's ability to work together to further the institution in the face of these challenges and the willingness to engage in open communication about issues that confront them.

The team would like to make the following specific commendations that address the strengths and successes that the college has achieved:

- 1. The college's response to the previous team's recommendations was outstanding and clearly exceeded expectations. Over the last five years the college has developed an extensive and expansive assessment process and infrastructure. The Guam Community College Comprehensive Institutional Assessment Plan is a major accomplishment and places the college significantly ahead of other community colleges in the development of processes that address the new accreditation standards, which are organized around assessment, outcomes and program improvement based on resulting information and dialogue. This has been a major undertaking for the college, involving nearly every program, service and function of the college and a major commitment of human resources and college-wide participation. The visiting team takes note of this heroic effort and expresses its hope that the college will sustain and expand on its efforts to date. The college will benefit from the continued use and development of the infrastructure that it has established, and the team looks forward to the college continuing its leadership in this area.
- 2. The team takes note of the positive attitude of all the members of the Guam Community College family and commends everyone for their exceptional resiliency and dedication in the face of natural and economic adversity.

- 3. The college is to be commended for establishing an improved degree of budget stability in a complex and variable funding environment. The team takes note of the high degree of regard the college has earned on the island for responsible budget management among public agencies.
- 4. The dynamic and creative Continuing Education Program is commended for its high degree of program development and successful operation. The program is an excellent example of what can be accomplished when multiple departments work together to meet the needs of the community. The program provides support for many programs on campus, is a major factor in the economic development of the island, and contributes significantly to the financial condition of the college.

## Recommendations

Based on the cumulative evidence of the self study, documents, interviews, and analysis and discussion among team members, the following recommendations were developed and approved by the team.

1. The college has adopted new math and English course requirements for all certificate and degree programs. These requirements are unitary for all programs. The college should assess the effect of these new requirements on student access and success. Based on an assessment of the student learning outcomes for each program, the college should engage in a dialogue about the appropriate levels of English and math to require for various programs. (Standard II.A.3)

A standardized general education pattern has likewise been established. To further opportunities for students to meet general education requirements at transfer institutions and to provide an opportunity for a greater breadth of understanding of the major areas of knowledge including humanities and fine arts, a dialogue should occur to consider adding classes to the general education curriculum. (Standard II.A.3.a)

- 2. The college is considering a more formal organization for faculty participation in shared governance such as the initiation of a faculty senate. The college should finish its work on developing a formal system for faculty, staff, and student participation in the governance processes of the college. Such systems should provide clear lines of communication and contribute to timely decision making oriented toward the positive development of the institution. (Standard IV.A.1, IV.A.2, IV.A.2.a, IV.A.3.)
- 3. Working on the strength of its assessment infrastructure, the college should now fully undertake the process of developing student learning outcomes for courses, programs and the institution. As these student learning outcomes are developed

- they should be communicated to students, the college community and the public. (Standards II.A, II.A.1.c, II.A.2.b, II.A.2.e, II.A.2.f)
- 4. The Board of Trustees is now fully empanelled and evidences a commitment to further the development of the college. Provision should be made to provide training for the Board to assist them in fulfilling this commitment. After the Board adopts its recently revised manual it should engage in a review of Board policies. (Standards IV.B.1.e, IV.B.1.f, IV.B.1.g)

## INTRODUCTION

Guam Community College is located on the island of Guam, the largest and most developed island in Micronesia. The island is surrounded by the Pacific Ocean on the east and the Philippine Sea on the west. Guam is approximately 30 miles long and 4 to 9 miles wide. The northern end of Guam is a plateau of rolling hills and cliffs rising to 600 feet above sea level. Waterfalls, rivers and bays abound throughout Guam's central and southern areas. Luxury 5 star hotels line the Tumon Bay beachfront. Guam is 3,800 miles west of Hawaii and about half that distance from Japan and the Philippines. Flight time from California to Guam is about 13 hours.

Guam was ceded to the United States from Spain in 1898. The indigenous Chamorro population became American citizens in 1950. As of July 2005 the population of Guam is reported at 168,564 made up of native Chamorro 37.1%, Filipino 26.3%, other Pacific islander 11.3%, white 6.9%, other Asian 6.3%, other ethnic origin or mixed 12.1% (2000 census). The economy depends on military spending and tourism (90% of which is from Japan).

The college was established in 1977 by Public Law 14-77. Guam Community College is the only community college on Guam and operates as part of the executive branch of the Government of Guam. The college is governed by a seven member Board of Trustees including one voting student trustee. The Board members are appointed by the Governor of Guam.

## **ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS**

#### 1. AUTHORITY

Guam Community College currently operates under Guam Public Law 14-77 and operates as part of the executive branch of the Government of Guam. Guam Community College is accredited by the Accrediting Commission of Community and Junior Colleges of the Western Association of Schools and Colleges.

#### 2. MISSION

The visiting team confirmed that Guam Community College has an established mission statement that contains information as specified in accreditation Eligibility Requirements. This statement was last revised and adopted by the Board of Trustees in February 2005.

#### 3. GOVERNING BOARD

Authority to make policy and exercise oversight for all operations is vested in a seven member Board of Trustees appointed by the Governor of Guam with the advice and consent of the Legislature. Six trustees are appointed for staggered terms of five years, and the student trustee is appointed for a term of two years. The Governor must appoint one trustee to represent business, industry and employer organizations and one trustee to represent organized labor organizations on the island. The student trustee has full voting rights on the Board. Board members are precluded by Public Law 14-77 from participating in any action involving a possible conflict of interest or from realizing a financial gain from their positions as Board members.

## 4. CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

The full-time chief executive officer of Guam Community College is Dr. Herominiano delos Santos who has served in this capacity since June 2000. By policy and college organization, Dr. delos Santos possesses the requisite authority to administer board policies. He does not serve as chair of the Board of Trustees.

## 5. ADMINISTRATIVE CAPACITY

The visiting team determined that the college has sufficient administrators, all very well experienced and professionally prepared to support the mission and purpose of the college.

## 6. OPERATIONAL STATUS

Guam Community College is fully operational with students actively enrolled in degree and certificate programs.

#### 7. DEGREES

Guam Community College offers 14 certificate programs and 19 Associate Degree Programs. The college also offers a number of career vocational programs in the island's four high schools. Enrollment data indicates that a substantial proportion of the college's postsecondary students are enrolled in courses leading to a degree.

## 8. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS

The visiting team found that the degree programs offered by the college are consistent with the college's mission and purpose. The courses and programs were organized and delivered at an appropriate level consistent with Eligibility Requirements.

#### 9. ACADEMIC CREDIT

The team examined course outlines which documented that the institution awards credits based on generally accepted practices in colleges and universities. The college catalog provides appropriate information about the awarding of academic credit.

## 10. STUDENT LEARNING AND ACHIEVEMENT

Course outlines examined by the team verified that learning objectives are established for each course. The college is well along in the process leading to the establishment of student learning outcomes for courses, programs and the institution.

#### 11. GENERAL EDUCATION

The college catalog provides a clear general education pattern for degree programs which includes required competence in writing and computational skills as well as an introduction to some of the major areas of knowledge. These requirements are consistent with standard practice in higher education. A recommendation is presented in the visiting team report about adding an area of knowledge not now addressed in the college's general education pattern.

## 12. ACADEMIC FREEDOM

The current faculty contract contains a statement of academic freedom that sets forth the freedom to examine all knowledge appropriate to a discipline or area of study. This statement is reinforced by an adopted Board of Trustees policy.

#### 13. FACULTY

As of November 2005, Guam Community College had a complement of 104 full time faculty positions with nine vacant faculty positions (representing funded plans to fully develop the newly created Practical Nursing Program). Faculty responsibilities for the

development and review of curriculum as well as the assessment of learning are contained in the faculty contract.

## 14. STUDENT SERVICES

The team found that the college strives to provide services to support its very diverse student population and that these services are adequate to meet eligibility requirements. These services are consistent with the college's mission and purpose.

#### 15. ADMISSIONS

The College catalog and other publications set forth admission policies for Guam Community College. These polices are consistent with Guam public law and Board adopted policies.

## 16. INFORMATION AND LEARNING RESOURCES

Guam Community College provides modern information resources and services to support its mission and some forward-thinking technology to support the development and assessment of its programs and services.

## 17. FINANCIAL RESOURCES

The adopted college budget and annual audit report document that Guam Community College has the financial resources to adequately support its learning programs and services. The college is largely dependent on funding from the Guam legislature and from tuition. The college has achieved an increased degree of funding stability in recent years.

## 18. FINANCIAL ACCOUNTABILITY

An examination of the most recent external audit (September 2004) found some reportable conditions in the area of internal control over financial reporting and no instances of noncompliance with Government Auditing Standards.

## 19. INSTITUTIONAL PLANNING AND EVALUATION

The commitment of the college to college-wide planning and evaluation was well documented by their efforts in recent years as documented by the Guam Community College Comprehensive Institutional Assessment Plan for Programs, Services, Administrative Units and the Board of Trustees.

#### 20. PUBLIC INFORMATION

All information required by the eligibility requirements is contained in the college catalog and on the college's wel-designed web site (<a href="www.guamcc.edu">www.guamcc.edu</a>).

# 21. RELATIONS WITH THE ACCREDITING COMMISSION

The self study contained the requisite statement and signatories to certify that the institution adheres to the Eligibility Requirements and Standards of the Accrediting Commission.

# RESPONSES TO RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PREVIOUS TEAM March 14 – 16, 2000

## General Recommendations 1, 2, 3

- 1. In view of the absence of a response to the previous team's recommendations and the importance of establishing a systematic assessment procedure for educational programs, student services, financial programs and physical facilities, the team recommends that such a comprehensive system be developed and implemented over the next year. The educational program review should identify educational quality through the identification of learner outcomes.
- 2. In light of the persisting difficulty with systematic assessments and evaluations of programs, services, and personnel, the team recommends that staff development be provided for the college community to clarify the importance of regular reviews as a process for continuing improvement and the necessity for the Board of Trustees, administration, and faculty to be appropriately involved in these processes.
- 3. In exercising its oversight responsibility, the team recommends that the Board enforce its policies concerning program review and develop or strengthen policies related to assessing the Board's as well as the college's effectiveness.

In view of the fact that all three general recommendations made by the previous visiting team dealt with the issue of institutional assessment, this report will address the college's response to these recommendations through a combined analysis.

To say that the college has fully responded to the above stated recommendations would be somewhat of an understatement. The comprehensive, campus-wide assessment process observed by the Interim Visiting Team in April 2002 has continued to develop and expand so as to constitute a regular assessment of all activities of the college including administration, instruction, student services, business services and the Board of Trustees. The process is well documented in the *Guam Community College Comprehensive Institutional Assessment Plan for Programs, Services, Administrative Units, and the Board of Trustees.* The newest development was the implementation of software (TracDat) which records assessment activities and outcomes. The Office of Assessment and Institutional Effectiveness was created and staffed in the 2003-2004 academic year to recognize the institution's ongoing commitment to institutional assessment.

Training and staff development with regard to the assessment process have been ongoing, and interviews with administration, faculty, and staff revealed a college-wide acknowledgement and, if not appreciation, acceptance of the process. Materials and guidance on using the process and supportive software are provided through workshops

and the work of the College Assessment Committee. Much of this supportive material is kept in an open access room referred to as the "Assessment Shrine" and "pilgrimages" continue to occur as the involvement of faculty and staff broadens.

On September 4, 2002, the Board of Trustees adopted Policy 306, *Comprehensive Assessment of Instructional Programs, Student Services, Administrative Units and the Board of Trustees.* The new policy speaks directly to the new ACCJC accreditation standards and student learning outcomes, and requires a staggered annual or bi-annual assessment of all programs, services, administrative units, the Board of Trustees, and the Foundation Board. With the recent appointment of two new Board of Trustee members, the Board is now fully empanelled. Interviews with five of seven board members revealed a good understanding and support for the process and a commitment to institutionalization as well as a continued willingness to participate actively in the process.

## **Specific Recommendations**

Specific recommendations related to the accreditation standards in force during the last comprehensive visit are addressed below rather than attempting to relate them to the new standards.

- A review of the mission statement might consider:
  - 1. How effectively does the statement convey the mission of the college, both to the college community and the larger community?

The college focused on its mission statement subsequent to the previous team's report, and the Board of Trustees adopted a revised mission statement in June 2003 with a scheduled reexamination in January 2004. The statement was reviewed by the President's Management Team in January 2004 and was deemed acceptable for the coming year although they agreed that a more comprehensive review should take place. Later in 2004 the Office of Assessment and Institutional Effectiveness took the lead in the institutional review of the Mission Statement, resulting in a revision that was passed by the Board of Trustees on February 9, 2005.

## 2. Does the statement drive institutional planning and decision making?

The Mission Statement is required as the beginning reference point in all Assessment Plans in the Guam Community College Comprehensive Institutional Assessment Plan for Programs, Services, Administrative Units, and the Board of Trustees. The college intended that the mission statement be included prominently in the Institutional Strategic Master Plan as a driving force. While still in draft form, the December 2005 Institutional Strategic Master Plan does not accomplish the goal of fully incorporating the Mission Statement. Judging from work done on other aspects of their assessment and planning process, it is reasonable to assume that the newly adopted Mission Statement will be incorporated into subsequent drafts.

• The college community should develop ethical standards for adoption at the Board of Trustees' level. Such a policy or policies must include academic freedom and should cover professional conduct, including adjunct faculty, and/or a code of ethics.

The Agreement between *The Guam Federation of Teachers Local 1581*AFT/AFL-CIO & The Board of Trustees, Guam Community College for Faculty,
2000 - 2005, includes Article VI Faculty Rights to Academic Freedom which has been renewed in the 2005 – 2010 Agreement. The Board of Trustees adopted Policy 460 B
Academic Freedom. *The Rules and Regulations for Classified Service Employees* outlines a code of conduct for classified employees. Although there was evidence of dialogue on the issue of a code of ethics for faculty, no formal statement has been adopted. The intention is that this issue will be addressed through the process underway to establish a faculty senate at the college. Discussions with administration and faculty confirmed this intention.

• The team recommends that the college reviews and fully implements its Affirmative Action plan to promote and ensure equity and diversity in the college community (administrators, faculty and staff).

While the college has paid attention to this recommendation through review by administration and analysis of EEO data for past years, an updated plan has just been developed and approved. This plan will be implemented further after the team's visit. Employment data and current demographic information does support the college's contention that its employees are reflective of the community it serves. Human resource and EEO staff attended a workshop sponsored by the Society of Human Resource Management in December 2005 and the college states an intention to update its current Affirmative Action Plan.

• The college implement and support an English and Mathematics assessment and sequencing program to insure student access to appropriate courses and permit program completions in a reasonable time.

The college responded to this recommendation by noting that a lack of a standardized general education pattern for all programs and a lack of a multiple year scheduling process hindered students' access to appropriate courses and negatively impacted program completion. Therefore, the college responded by implementing a standard general education pattern for all programs which is currently in place. The college also developed a five-year class schedule so department chairpersons, associate deans, and deans are able to more clearly view cyclical patterns of course delivery to facilitate effective sequencing. Continuous registration and assigned faculty advisors have resulted in students being more effective in scheduling classes. The new GE standards also include a time requirement for students to meet Math and English requirements: English by the time they are enrolled in 12 units, math by the time they enroll in 15 units. With

these substantive changes in requirements, it was difficult for the team to assess whether access and ease of completion has been enhanced. Therefore, a follow-up recommendation from the current team is included in its final report.

• To take full advantage of the significant professional development resources, the team recommends that a Full- and Part-time Faculty (including staff and administrators who teach) Evaluation system that covers teaching effectiveness, scholarship, service and other respective institutional responsibilities be developed and implemented.

A formal evaluation process for full time faculty has been developed and included in *The Guam Federation of Teachers Local 1581 AFT/AFL-CIO & The Board of Trustees, Guam Community College for Faculty Agreement.* This formal process is currently in use. Evaluation of adjunct faculty began in 2003 as an assignment to the Adjunct Associate Dean position, and has continued each semester. Evaluation is to occur at least once during each semester in each class being taught by adjunct faculty.

• To predictably meet maintenance needs, the team recommends that the college develops and implements strategies to raise the level of funding for campus maintenance and renovation projects.

The college has been able to leverage funds from tuition/fee revenues, FEMA reimbursements and Tobacco Settlement Funds. This effort has provided over \$2.7 million for maintenance, facility and infrastructure upgrades and capital projects. The college additionally has an endowment fund in excess of \$1.7 million earmarked for major upgrades to college facilities. The visiting team was impressed by the attractive, cost-effective remodeling efforts underway on campus. While the effects of two major typhoons in 2002 are still visible, the campus has made major progress in renovation and remodeling.

• Given the Government of Guam's current financial position, the team recommends that the college take appropriate steps to plan for the unpredictability of its funding sources to address its institutional priorities.

The college is to be commended for the increased level of budget stability that it has managed to engineer since the last accreditation visit. In budget year 2002, the Legislature rolled all the separate appropriations for the College into a single appropriation from the Government of Guam General Fund. While this approach has not fully resolved the College's economic situation, the approach has significantly reduced the locations from which uncertainty arises. The college has capitalized on this development by modifying its budget development process to more accurately predict revenues and expenditures. Coupled with a strong entrepreneurial spirit, the college has made strides that have earned it high marks on the island as being a financially stable and responsible public agency.

• As recommended by the previous team, the present team urges the Board of Trustees to continue its efforts with ACCT's support to expeditiously establish a formal process for evaluating its performance.

In 2001, the Board of Trustees made a good effort at evaluating its own performance by having each Trustee complete a Board Self-assessment Questionnaire modeled after a similar tool used by the Edmonds Community College in Lynnwood, Washington. However the assessment did not include input from outside the Board, and the college states it is not satisfied with the status of Board evaluation even though this is a required element in the *Guam Community College Comprehensive Institutional Assessment Plan for Programs, Services, Administrative Units, and the Board of Trustees.* Interviews with Board members indicated a willingness to further the evaluation effort, because two board members are quite new, there was an expressed interest in training for board members as a precursor to evaluation. The current team has included a recommendation in its findings on this point.

# EVALUATION OF GUAM COMMUNITY COLLEGE THEMATIC ANALYSIS

Guam Community College organized its self-evaluation process around the four ACCJC Standards. In doing so the college attempted to utilize a thematic approach in reviewing the standards. The College presented a report within their self study on how the themes guided the GCC Self-Study Process. Presented in this section are observations made by the various writing teams for the four standards on how successful the College was in this attempt.

## Theme: Dialogue

• Formal structures for dialogue are being developed. Extensive dialog takes place at the college. The college implemented a Technology Advisory Committee to set college-wide policies and to communicate the technology priorities to the college as a whole. The college also is implementing assessment processes for each unit, and the assessment goals are communicated college-wide. A draft strategic plan is now available to all staff, and a new affirmative action plan was recently approved to communicate to the college community and the Guam Island community the importance of diversity.

## Theme: Student Learning Outcomes

• Serious efforts have been put forward in an attempt to establish student learning outcomes at the course, program, and institutional level; however, more work is needed Linking student learning outcomes (SLOs) to resources is a goal for the college, but the college needs to continue work in this area. SLOs are a high priority for the college as evidenced through interviews with college staff and review of their technology plan, master plan, and assessment plan. The infrastructure is in place to move the college forward in addressing students' needs.

#### Theme: Institutional Commitments

• The revised mission statement has provided for an expansion of the development of a Liberal Studies major and has articulated the college's commitment to General Education.

Theme: Evaluation, Planning and Improvement

• Whereas evaluation is in place in some aspects, ties to planning and improvement are not clearly evident with respect to identifying and addressing student needs. Evaluation, planning, and improvement are a very high priority for GCC and are evidenced throughout Standard III. The college has implemented an assessment model for planning, both short-term and long-term for facilities, human resources, and technology. While further work remains in this area, many plans are underway at the college.

## Theme: Organization

• The College has identified the necessity to create adequate structures to address and support learning. Guam Community College has begun the work to develop processes for inclusive, informed, and intentional efforts to define student learning. While they have made some headway in this area through their assessment plans and TracDat, they have not yet clearly defined student learning outcomes. The college will need to first define student learning and then create a process to measure and validate student learning outcomes.

## Theme: Institutional Integrity

• The College has made progress in this area and continues to examine its policies and procedures for honest and equitable treatment of employees and students. The college demonstrates institutional integrity relative to fiscal accountability as evidenced by annual financial audits that receive the highest opinion possible from external auditors examining the fiscal affairs of the college. Institutional integrity is evidenced by the college's focus on a safe educational environment. Doing so, without adequate funding from the government of Guam, is a challenge. Institutional integrity is also evidenced through discussions with staff who discuss their loyalty to the institution, in part, because of the positive and ethical image the college has on the island. GCC is known as the best run government entity on the Island of Guam.

# **EVALUATION OF GUAM COMMUNITY COLLEGE ACCORDING TO ACCJC 2002 STANDARDS**

# Standard I Institutional Mission and Effectiveness

#### **General Observations**

The college has revised their mission statement and has undertaken to review this mission statement on an annual basis. The current mission statement was developed after much input and dialog by the faculty and the administration. A committee was established to work on this task, and faculty and staff were allowed to provide input as to how to best develop this revised mission statement.

## Findings and Evidence

#### A. Mission

Evidence of meaningful dialog and discussion were found in both BOT minutes as well as minutes of the College Affairs Committee and the committee for revising the mission statement. Interviews with Standard One committee members also reinforced that much discussion took place.

After much discussion and work, the final mission statement was submitted to the Board of Trustees (BOT) in February 2005. It was decided to make some changes to the statement, to more accurately reflect the college's commitment to general education as well as vocational training. These modifications were made to the mission statement, and it was approved and adopted by the Board at that time.

It was decided that the mission statement be reviewed on an annual basis. The next review of the mission statement will be later this year (2006) by faculty, staff, and administration.

The team has found, however, that the newest mission statement is not being used universally in all publications and materials. Instances in which the older mission statement was found include the student catalog and Guam Community College's website. The college should make a concerted effort to insure that the current mission statement is reflected in all documents, both published and online, and that the current mission statement's contents are communicated effectively to both employees of the college, as well as to the community as a whole. This is especially important since Guam Community College is at a true crossroads in many ways, both in terms of moving to a more shared-governance way of doing business and making decisions, and with respect to a renewed emphasis on general studies and a liberal arts philosophy.

The college also needs to make renewed efforts to assure that goals and objectives are in line with those of the new mission statement, especially as it addresses a commitment to

the diversity of its students and the academic as well as vocational aspects of its educational commitment.

## **B.** Improving Institutional Effectiveness

After receiving the recommendation that the college needed to establish and implement an assessment process, an assessment administrator was brought onboard to play a key role in beginning this process. The assessment administrator spent much time meeting with individual faculty and staff, as well as administrators, in determining the needs of all stakeholders before putting together a process.

There was much initial resistance to developing the assessment process, especially from faculty, who did not see the potential advantage of moving to a more data-driven environment. The assessment administrator and the academic vice-president both met with many individuals and formed several committees that were aimed at developing various aspects of the assessment process. In addition, the Board of Trustees also had to be convinced that development of the assessment process would benefit the college in the long run.

Several years of dialogue and discussion have resulted in faculty gradually coming to accept and support the concept that access to data involving their programs is much more positive in terms of analyzing how well their programs are doing and assisting them in doing a more accurate and timely program review, based on accurate data. What is not clear is the extent to which adjunct faculty and classified staff were involved in the process.

There are several administrative support services that now use the assessment process. The materials purchasing department, for example, uses the assessment site to facilitate the ordering of materials on a timely basis for various programs or departments.

Initially the college had decided on having assessment by all departments and programs to be conducted on a yearly basis. However, after much discussion, it was decided that a two-year cycle would be more acceptable and palatable for all concerned. A two-year cycle has been implemented and has been received in a much more positive light.

The college's programs and departments, both instructional and non-instructional, have been divided into four groups. Group A includes all Associate Degree programs; Group B includes all Certificate programs; Group C encompasses the Student Services and Administrative Units; and Group D includes all special programs.

Programs are notified via email that information must be entered or submitted to the assessment department. It is sometimes necessary to remind the program directors or faculty that they must submit their information in a timely manner. Because information supplied by the programs is crucial to the ongoing success of the assessment process, it is necessary that they comply with the deadlines in a timely manner.

The site team members were given an in-depth presentation of the TracDat online system. This online system links assessment and program review information including mission, goals and student learning outcomes, and demonstrates how they are all linked and related for any program on the campus. In addition, various elements of the accreditation standards are checked off if these have been met by the program. All of this information is made available to users on the campus via log-in to the TracDat website.

It is evident in discussions with various members of the campus community that the campus is now very supportive of the development and implementation of the assessment process. One of the more outspoken opponents of the process, a faculty member who was much opposed to the publication of data on his program as well as other programs, has become a strong advocate of the process. He has used the information available from the assessment process to do a better job of knowing what kinds of students are being served by the program, and how he can better attract students to his program, based on accurate data from the assessment process.

While the organization for assessment has been quite thorough, especially at the institutional level, at times the existence of reports or analyses of data has not been consistently communicated to the campus. That is, various people on the campus seem not to be aware of the existence of these reports, or are not aware that TracDat has become a powerful vehicle for accessing data and reports at the program or institutional level.

Continuous training is provided to the college community on access to and use of the TracDat system. In addition the program specialist and program assistant for assessment will be attending a query-builder training session, to better enable them to access the data from the assessment server and to create specific reports.

#### **Conclusions**

The college has developed an extremely full-featured and useful assessment process, and is to be commended for the amount of effort and work that it has taken to create such a dynamic system. Assessment processes can be monitored from the program up to the institutional levels, with clear linkages as to how goals and objectives are interrelated. The online assessment system allows one to select various programs at the college, with reports that allow one also to determine the extent to which programs are meeting accreditation standards measures and the ways program goals are being met.

# Standard II Student Learning Programs and Services

## **General Observations**

The Standard II team investigated the quality of the instructional programs, the student support services, and the library and learning support services, in achieving stated student learning outcomes. The College has a rich diversity of students and is working to implement instructional programs and student development efforts that support learning. We examined the policies and procedures relevant to this standard.

In particular, the team sought information regarding the general education and vocational programs including those areas offered through collaboration with high schools and through continuing education and contract education. The team also examined whether the College systematically assesses student support services using student learning outcomes, faculty and staff input, and other appropriate measures in order to improve the effectiveness of these services. The team suggests that the College increase the inclusion of all members of the college community, including students, in discussions relevant to this standard.

While we found that the College has an assessment program to evaluate the areas of this standard, we also discovered that the College could improve the ways it meets this standard by completing and better publicizing policies and procedures identified by previous accreditation teams. The College's established approach to assessment needs to be expanded to include studying and researching concerns related to identifying and meeting the educational needs of students and the possible disproportionate impact of policies and practices on specific students. Thus, although we found that the College has adopted a culture of assessment, we also found more work needs to be done on student learning outcomes.

The college organized its response to the accreditation standards through the themes the commission has identified, and the team agreed that those themes are present in the evidence the college provided.

## **Findings and Evidence**

## A. Instructional Programs

The college provides vocational and academic programs which are reflected in the new mission statement adopted by the board in 2005. A new degree in liberal studies, a new practical nursing program, and a clearly delineated general education pattern have been added since the last accreditation visit. Two courses are now online. (II.A.1.) Programs

have been assessed and basic competency student learning outcomes have been developed for most courses and programs, though not school-level ones for the School of Trades and Professional Services and the School of Technology and Student Services. SLOs in the actual course outlines generally identify outcomes in a manner more consistent with traditional methods of measuring student skills. For example, a 1995 course revision for CD 140, Environments for Young Children, gives as an outcome under nutrition, "Students will identify foods considered not appropriate for health reasons for children of different ages." Similarly, older course outlines are skill based as well. For example, ME150A, Auto Service I, gives as an outcome, "Given a vehicle, proper parts, hand tools and test equipment, student will service an air filter." Some course outlines do not have dates especially those for the high school curriculum, so determining the recency of the courses was difficult. In a few cases, randomly selected course outlines in vocational areas lacked outcomes and some outlines had not been revised since the 1980s. (II.A.1.a., A.1.b., A.1.c)

The college may want systematically to identify the educational needs of its students, evaluate whether or not the programs it offers meet student needs, and examine the delivery systems and modes of instruction being used as those relate to meeting student needs. (II.A.1.a, A.1.b)

Tying the assessment program to the student learning outcomes and also to the allocation of resources and to program improvements is a work in progress. The college has created an assessment culture where data is available to drive decision making.

The college has a process for revising and submitting curriculum. Using this process, course outlines are in various stages of currency. For example, 76% of the computer science course outlines are five years old. In some cases, curriculum is driven by enrollment: if students are not taking classes, the classes are not offered. This was the case with the college construction program where employment opportunities have waned in recent years. In other cases, the college has been able to respond to requests for classes based on input from the community. For example, the college has an agreement allowing it to offer training for local teachers through collaboration with the University of San Diego. (II.A.2.a.) While these informal methods of developing or offering curriculum appear to meet the community's needs, the college should adopt a systematic process of updating and revising curriculum to maintain currency even when curriculum is not being scheduled.

The college has involved faculty in assessing programs, and the curriculum process begins with faculty input. However, the role of faculty has not been paramount in all curriculum decisions. For example, the administration mandated that students complete a particular level of English before completing 9 units and a specific math level before completing 12 units. These requirements were based upon a desire by the administration to increase academic rigor but did not include an assessment based analysis of competency levels appropriate for various programs. It is also not clear that the college has decided to support this requirement with appropriate ESL courses and remedial courses. (II.A.2.b)

Faculty have been trained in meeting students' learning styles and other pedagogical strategies through two required courses for new full time faculty and through special training for service learning implementation. Other staff development opportunities fall under the purview of the Professional Development Committee and include fees for classes and conferences specific to faculty disciplines. (II.A.2.d)

The college is involved in program evaluation in an informal manner growing mostly from the review of curriculum as well as from demands from businesses. Consistent and formal input from advisory committees and surveys of employers or graduates concerning success in their vocational areas is available for grant-funded programs. Because many of the current high school program faculty in vocational programs have recent experience in the business world, the instructors have not actively pursued formal advisory committee input; however, as these new employees are more removed from the world of work, they will need the input from advisory committees whose members are current in the field. The college still needs to complete the process of validating that degrees and certificates are based on the achievement of a program's stated student learning outcomes. Formal information gathering and analysis will assist the college in determining the relevance and currency of programs and help the college plan for the future (II.A.2.e; A.2.f)

As the college develops student learning outcomes for all areas, these will naturally be tied to awarding of credit and degrees. (II.A.1.h., A.1.i)

In addition to the regular curriculum for community college and high school students, the college has an active continuing education program which is self-supporting and provides a healthy income to the college. The program annually "touches" 10,000 individuals. The highest enrolled courses in this area are health certificates for food service workers, food service management certification, continuing education to recertify public school teachers, public safety academies, general interest courses for the community, college for kids, and English language for children from Korea and China.

The college has published a clearly articulated and comprehensive philosophy of general education. The courses within the general education requirement have been articulated with the University of Guam and the University of Hawaii. (II.A.3.a, A.3.b)

Students appear to receive clear and accurate information about the general education requirements although this information appears in the errata section of the catalogue. The college catalogue provides students with transfer and articulation information only in the appendix of the catalogue. Using the rubric of articulation, though, may cause some confusion among students. (II.A.3)

The major challenge for the general education program is the limited number of courses that fulfill general education requirements, particularly in the humanities and fine arts. It is also not always clear in course descriptions how and why a particular course fulfills aspects of the general education requirements, especially in oral communication and

citizenship. Recent development of the liberal arts curriculum might enhance the general education offerings and make transfer more viable as this program grows and the college recognizes more courses as fulfilling general education requirements. The institution needs to review its course offerings in general to make the general education program more comprehensive. Still, both the general education and liberal arts programs contribute to the college fulfilling its mission to serve its constituents academically as well as vocationally. (II.A.3.a)

The new requirements for English and math as well as the new liberal arts associate degree have created some concern among faculty that the college may be turning away from its traditional vocational role. There are also concerns that the new requirements close students out of various courses and programs, concerns reflected in some course enrollment drops. Some efforts are being made through the general education committee to address the appropriateness of the requirement for specific programs. Continued allocation of resources based on assessment of community and student needs should alleviate these concerns as the college continues to evolve. (II.A.3.b)

Most of the degrees offered by Guam Community College require that students complete more than 60 units. Requiring that a student take that many units implies that the time to degree completion for an average student would be more than 2 years. The general education committee expressed concern that students are being required to complete so many units and may be required, especially because of the new math and English requirements, to take more than 2 years to complete a degree. (II.A.4) The team shares this concern.

In programs requiring external licensure and certification, the college has demonstrated that students meet standards. Data on the newly developed practical nursing program is not yet available. For that particular program, the team voiced some concerns about the depth of faculty expertise needed to offer the program (II.A.5) as the college has yet to fill most of the projected faculty positions.

Students appear to receive clear and accurate information. However, the current mission statement has not yet been consistently presented in publications and some information needs to made more "student friendly."

Information about College courses, programs, policies and regulations is available for students and prospective students in the College Catalog, the Student Handbook, and the College's website. The Student Handbook is no longer provided in a print format, but can be found through the College's website. Articulation agreements are included in appendices in the catalog, but the function and process of transfer is not clearly presented as an educational goal for students. The transfer mission is not as clearly laid out for students as the vocational paths. (II.6.a)

The college also needs to add some course options or identify existing ones so that students can actually complete all of the requirements for transfer and all of the general education requirements on the Guam Community College campus. For example, the

college has humanities courses, but these are not listed as options in the general education pattern. The student handbook is on the web, but students cannot search the site and must read the entire handbook in order to find a particular topic. Students receive syllabi in most classes based on records kept by the Academic Vice President's office. In some cases, the course descriptions in the syllabi do not match the course descriptions in the catalogue. Student learning outcomes for each course have yet to be developed. (II.A.6)

The college has a program discontinuance policy which it has implemented with careful consideration of student needs. This policy and others relevant to students are spelled out in the catalogue; however, the committee could not find an honesty policy or a sexual harassment policy in printed documents provided to students nor a policy related to codes of conduct for faculty and staff published for the public although codes of conduct exist in the collective bargaining agreements for full time faculty and staff. (II.A.6.a, IIA.6.b)

Based on the student questionnaires, the committee believes that students feel respected and treated well by faculty in terms of their gender and racial/ethnic group membership. The college did not provide information concerning faculty ability to appear unbiased. (II.A.7.a.)

The college has published policies on academic honesty in the student handbook which is on-line. (II.A.7.b) Other policies of behavior for faculty are addressed in the contract and for students in the handbook. The college has deferred the development of an ethics policy until a Faculty Senate is established to take responsibility for such a policy. (II. A.7.c)

Guam Community College offers courses on the island only. (II.A.8)

## **B. Student Support Services**

In several instances, Guam Community College (GCC) cites a need to improve its marketing and recruitment efforts, favoring more "face to face" recruitment efforts and development of marketing plans. A comprehensive effort to address outreach and recruitment efforts has not materialized, but is included in recommendations found in the "Faces of the Future" which was conducted in Fall 2004. The diversity of students is not clearly delineated in Guam Community College's research documents or self study.

An effort to admit students based on their ability to benefit from programs, as well as to be consistent with its mission, has been made by requiring student qualification for the Adult High School Diploma Program and enrollment in English and math courses at nine and 12 units. This policy remains a subject of debate on campus, as many faculty have concerns about the impact of this administratively mandated policy on student access and success.

The leadership in the Counseling Department has worked closely with the Office of Assessment and Institutional Effectiveness to utilize results from student surveys to identify student needs and to make improvements in the provision of support services to students. A good example has been the surveying of students and faculty about the counseling and guidance needs of students. The results were used not only to plan effective workshops for students but to better coordinate counseling activities provided by various offices and programs, thereby controlling for duplication of efforts.

The present dialog that is occurring on the impact of these policies is a good indication of concern for the students' pathways. Various committees (General Education and Committee with No Name) have requested further data from Admissions to assist them in further understanding the impact of these policies on student access and success. The College's established approach to assessment may not lend itself to studying and researching concerns related to the educational needs of students and the possible disproportionate impact of policies and practices on specific students. Student Services staff, especially counselors, have utilized various means to obtain outcome data from which they developed an agenda for improvement. Not all departments have yet measured their effectiveness, either through quantitative data or through qualitative measures (surveys); however, several departments were able to detail student satisfaction as well as recommendations for change.

Student Support Services staff have made excellent progress in developing various modes of service delivery by which to best meet students' needs. An excellent example is the recent hiring and placement of four counselors at each of the high schools served by Guam Community College. This insures that the counseling function, including the appropriate recruiting of students, will be done by counseling faculty who are knowledgeable and committed to the mission of Guam Community College. (II.B.1)

The committee reviewed the catalogue and found evidence that the majority of the required catalogue information was provided. (II.B.2):

Required Information	Evidence Found
a. General Information	
Official Name, Address(es),	Everything is found on the back side of the catalog
Telephone Number(s), and Web Site	except for names and addresses of high school
Address of the Institution	(secondary) sites. The main college phone number is
	not listed, but the office of Admissions and Registration
	is.
Educational Mission	The revised Mission Statement is on page 4 of the
	catalog.
Course, Program, and Degree	Course descriptions, certificate and degree program
Offerings	requirements are listed in the catalog.
Academic Calendar and Program	The Academic Calendar is clearly printed on the inside
Length	front cover of the catalog. The Calendar details the
	beginning and end of the term as well as critical
	deadline dates.
Academic Freedom Statement	The Academic Freedom Policy (460) is found on page
	123, (Appendix C) of the catalog.
Available Student Financial Aid	Financial Aid Services, including the specific student
	aid available is listed on pages 9-11 in the catalog.

	Also detailed are students' responsibilities.
Available Learning Resources	Under the heading of "Learning Resources
Available Learning Resources	Center/Library Services" the description on page 14 of
	the catalog details library services and does not speak
	about learning resources (i.e., tutoring).
Names and Degrees of Administrators	Names and degrees of administrators and faculty are
and Faculty	found in the back of the catalog, beginning on page
•	105.
Names of Governing Board Members	The names of the governing board members, except for two vacant positions, are listed on page 104 of the catalog.
b. Requirements	1 - Ç
Admissions	Admissions information is found on pages 18-20, with details about detailing classifications of students, acceptance and placement testing information, including foreign students.
Student Fees and Other Financial Obligations	Tuition and Fees and Cost of Attendance budget for full-time, independent students are listed on pages 29-31 of the catalog. Included are fee policies and financial obligation policies.
Degree, Certificates, Graduation and	Degree and certificate requirements are listed by
Transfer	program major as well as per General Education
	requirements on pages 33-34. Information specific to
	students who desire to transfer and transfer services are
	not found in the main section of the catalog under
	"General Information." Articulation agreements and an
	Inter Institutional Cooperation Statement for Transfer
	and Articulation are found in the back of the catalog
	under Appendices.
c. Major Policies Affecting Students	
Academic Regulations, including	Certain academic regulations such as registration, adds
Academic Honesty	and drops, withdrawals, repeats, satisfactory progress,
	probation, and dismissal are found under "Admissions
	Information" in the catalog. The Student Code of
	Conduct is referenced on page 5 of the catalog does not
	clearly cover Academic Honesty. However, the
	Student Handbook, which is available only on the
	website, might contain information about Academic
	Honesty.
Nondiscrimination	The Non-Discrimination Statement is found on page 5
	of the catalog.
Acceptance of Transfer Credits	Information about credit by examination, credit for
	military education, credit for prior learning and
	educational credit for training programs is found in the
	catalog. Additionally, transfer of credit information
	from postsecondary institutions and advanced
	placement is found in the catalog.
Grievance and Complaint Procedures	There is no specific reference to a grievance and/or
_	complaint procedure in the catalog. However, page 7
	details "Student Rights Advocacy" which highlights the

	role of the counseling staff in assisting students in "the protection of their basic human rights."
Sexual Harassment	A Sexual Assault Policy and a Workplace Violence Policy are on page 5 of the catalog. No specific section is included in the catalog regarding Sexual Harassment. However, the Student Handbook is referenced regarding Sexual Harassment Policy 185.
Refund of Fees	Mention of "Tuition and Fee Refund" is found on page 30 of the catalog. This citation mentions eligibility "during the 100% Refund Period." However, the definition of this time period is not specified.

## d. Locations or publications where other policies may be found

The Student Code of Conduct along with the Copyright Policy and Workplace Violence Policy are found on page 5 of the catalog. However, students' due process rights are not clearly articulated with regard to the College's Discipline policy and procedures in the catalog.

No clear evidence was found that specific learning support needs are researched or identified and that information then guides the development or improvement of services and programs. The placement testing process in place is used to determine the placement levels for students into math and English and reading courses. The data from the COMPASS instrument is not comprehensively used to inform the College about the academic needs of the students or to help in planning course offerings and scheduling of courses. There also was no evidence that any non-cognitive assessments take place (e.g., study skills assessments). (II.B.3)

The availability of tutoring, low usage of the library, the transfer advisement program, and the limitation of courses for limited English proficient students are areas staff identify as areas in need of improvement to provide comprehensive services to students. High school students enrolled in Guam Community College courses are able to access Guam Community College counseling support at their high schools. Counseling and other support services are provided to Adult High School students and Guam Community College high school students that are on the main Guam Community College campus, but not to students enrolled in the GED program. (II.B.3.a)

The college has addressed the personal and civic responsibility in a variety of ways. For example, the Center for Civic Engagement's mission statement is "To enhance student educational experiences through integration of academic study with active service, while encouraging civic involvement, community awareness and responsible leadership." Guam Community College is part of the Hawaii Pacific Islands Campus Compact (HPICC), a national project designed to prepare civically engaged citizens. Building upon the notion of service learning, the Center develops partnerships between the College and service agencies and community based organizations. To date there are over 30 established partnerships, with over 200 students participating in the program. Additionally, the Center for Civic Engagement provides training to faculty in order to imbed service learning into their courses in order to assist them in meeting and measuring student learning outcomes. (II.B.3.b)

In terms of personal development, there are two psychology classes that address personal development of students: PY 100 – Personal Adjustment and PY 125 – Interpersonal Relations. (II.B.3.b)

The Center for Leadership Development Studies works with Campus Life and Career Placement to host an annual student leadership conference. The conference is well-attended and is very popular with students. Business partners are also a part of the conference which adds to the richness of the conference as well as provides additional fiscal support. (II.B.3.b)

The counseling faculty are fully engaged in assessing and improving the counseling and advising services to students. After a student declares his/her major course of study, the advisement function is enhanced by assigning a faculty member to serve as an advisor. A comprehensive training process for faculty advisors was undertaken in order to train the faculty in the basic use of NIAS and the different tools available in advising students. This has been fully documented in the Fifth Annual Institutional Assessment Report (II.B.3.c)

The counseling faculty have developed an Advocacy Booklet, ready for publication, which will serve as a campus-wide guide to assist all faculty and staff in understanding the comprehensive services provided through the Counseling department. The booklet will also serve as a tool to help all campus personnel in guiding students. The counseling department is to be commended for developing this publication through an excellent process of gathering feedback from faculty and students, studying other models, and developing a unique tool for Guam Community College. (II.B.3.c)

The student population of Guam Community College is naturally very diverse. Through various student clubs and organizations, student diversity is addressed. Less clear was whether there are college-wide programs or efforts to promote greater student understanding between groups and to promote a general appreciation of the value of diversity, especially important because of the wide range of diversity of students (from resident Chamorro and Filipino students to Micronesian and international students from Japan). Because of the broad range of age and life experiences of students, future assessment efforts could focus more on the educational needs of both day and evening students, and younger as well as older adult students.

The College is proud of the recent development and implementation of accommodative services for disabled students and believes that this new effort assists the College in expanding a commitment to meeting the needs of diverse students. (II.B.3.d)

There is no evidence that the admissions and placement instruments and practices are regularly reviewed or assessed in order to validate the effectiveness of the instruments or the minimizing of potential bias in the test instruments. The established assessment process was apparently not being consistently used in implementing new placement requirements related to the General Education requirements. The College has begun the initiation of a new placement tool, the COMPASS, and needs to work toward validating cut scores according to established research methods. (II.B.3.e)

Guam Community College admissions and financial aid staff are clearly cognizant of Federal Educational Rights to Privacy Act (FERPA) regulations and follow strict processes to insure security and confidentiality of records. Admissions keeps all hard copies of documents and is considering the implementation of an electronic document imaging system to provide greater security of documents and to facilitate retrieval of records. Campus NIAS users must sign an "Acceptance of Responsibility" form with the Admissions office and are then provided a copy of the Code of Responsibility and FERPA guidelines.(II.B.3.f)

Counseling and Health Services have done an excellent job in measuring student satisfaction with services. Coordination in the overall assessment and evaluation of student support services has yet to be established, with many different models being followed in the attempt to develop student learning outcomes. (II.B.4)

## C. Library and Learning Support Services

College faculty and staff appear to believe that the institution has sufficient library materials to support the institution's programs. The College has been proactive in seeking library resources to support the new nursing program and the library staff is seeking additional computer support for students. At the present time, 12 computer stations are available in the library for students to access online references as well as to complete class assignments. (II.C.1.a)

Learning resources were not clearly articulated as there are no comprehensive tutoring programs as part of the library. Formal tutorial services that are in existence are provided only through a federally funded TRIO grant and are only for students who qualify for that program (Project AIM). In the 2002 "What Are Guam Community College Students Like?" study, students were asked about their use of the library resources. The mode for all items was a "1"—indicating "never" in response to items such as

- Used the library as a quiet place to read or study
- Checked out books and other materials to read at home
- Use the card catalogue or computer to find materials the library had on a topic
- Prepared a bibliography or set of references for a term paper or report
- Asked the librarian for help in finding materials on some topic

These responses seem to point out that students are under-utilizing the library. Faculty have expressed their desire to have students increase their utilization of library resources. The General Education Committee has committed to working to infuse library and learning resources as part of ongoing curricula. It is hoped that the College will use the results of studies like the one in 2002 to identify areas of improvement and greater availability for learning resources for students. (II.C.2)

The library staff believe they are assisting the college in helping students gain information competency through the support offered in content classes. (II.C.1.b)

The college may wish to provide additional tutorial support as faculty evaluate the ways students can achieve the outcomes identified at the program and course level. (II.C.1.c) Like other areas of the campus, the library will need to be actively involved in developing and supporting student learning outcomes.

## **Conclusions**

The Standard II team believes that balancing accomplishments with areas that call for future development, the College has met the standard, but falls below in some areas.

- Commendable progress has been made to institute a comprehensive culture of assessment within student learning programs and services. As demonstrated through the College's TracDat software system, the large majority of departments and programs have begun the process of developing their assessment plans through specifying their "Means of Assessment." Several departments and programs have been able to complete "Summary of Results" and "Use of Assessment Results and Follow-Up."
- While progress has been made with respect to student learning outcomes, the team found that in some course outlines, competency skills were substituted for student learning outcomes. Most student learning outcomes have not been published.
- Greater involvement by faculty, staff, and students would enhance all of the accreditation themes, especially dialogue, organization, and evaluation and planning.
- Library services appear to be sufficient for the current student population; however, use of library resources by students could be increased.
- In an honest attempt to address an academic concern, the College implemented recent changes in the General Education requirement for English and math. These changes have posed serious concerns about the outcome of policies on student access as well as their successful progression through the institution.
- Considerable concern exists about the student pathway through the institutional experience in terms of student access, progress, learning and success. The College has work to do to meet the varied educational needs of its students based on the diversity and demographics of its student body. Of specific concern is the limitation of tutorial and English language support programs for students at the same time that academic requirements have been raised.

## Recommendations

1. The college has adopted new math and English course requirements for all certificate and degree programs. These requirements are unitary for all programs. The college should assess the effect of these new requirements on student access and success. Based on an assessment of the student learning outcomes for each program, the college should engage in a dialogue about the appropriate levels of English and math to require for various programs. (Standard II.A.3)

A standardized general education pattern has likewise been established. To further opportunities for students to meet general education requirements at transfer institutions and to provide an opportunity for a greater breadth of understanding of the major areas of knowledge including humanities and fine arts, a dialogue should occur to consider adding classes to the general education curriculum. (Standard II.A.3.a)

3. Working on the strength of its assessment infrastructure, the college should now fully undertake the process of developing student learning outcomes for courses, programs and the institution. As these student learning outcomes are developed they should be communicated to students, the college community and the public. (Standard II.A, II.A.1.c, II.A.2.b, II.A.2.e, II.A.2.f)

# Standard III Resources

## II. General Observations

Guam Community College (GCC) meets the criteria set forth in Standard III, Resources. Standard III addresses human, physical, technological, and fiscal resources of GCC. Since the last accreditation report and the mid-term report, GCC has made significant progress in all four parts of Standard III. It is evident based on face-to-face interviews with Guam staff and students that the college takes accreditation very seriously and is committed to continually working to make their college better for students, staff, and the community of Guam.

The college addressed the accreditation themes throughout the self-study report and wove the themes through Standard III very effectively. Dialogue is present in nearly every aspect of the standard.

#### A. Human Resources

#### **General Observations**

Guam Community College responded fully to this standard by providing evidence that the college has hiring and evaluation procedures in place for permanent faculty, staff, and administrators. The college provides professional development for faculty and staff. There are two staff development days per academic year for faculty. Classified staff and administrators also have opportunities for staff development. Evidence in the way of written application and screening hiring procedures demonstrate that due diligence is followed to hire quality staff. Human Resources (HR) has begun the process to integrate HR planning with institutional planning by way of assessment and linkage to the strategic master plan.

The self study report and relevant documents provide substantial evidence that Guam Community College (GCC) seeks and employs personnel who are qualified in education, training, and experience. GCC has no control over classified employee job descriptions because classified job descriptions are linked to Guam's Civil Service Commission. Civil Service job descriptions are not aligned to the service needs of the college.

## Findings and Evidence

The team found that the institution employs qualified personnel and is working towards linking hiring to program review and assessment. The link between GCC and the Civil Services Commission (CSC) presents some obstacles for GCC when hiring classified staff. The Civil Services Commission's job descriptions are outdated and at times are not aligned with the services required at the college. The college outsources services for

security, grounds, custodial and food services due to a shortage of funding from the government of Guam to hire classified staff.

The self study report, staff interviews, and documents provide evidence to confirm that permanent personnel are evaluated systematically through a fair and regular process. Adjunct faculty are evaluated through an informal process which involves observations by the Associate Dean and the Department Chairperson. The Associate Dean's observation reports are sent to the Human Resource Office, Assessment Office (with no ID attached), and department chair with the understanding that the department chair will discuss the report with the adjunct faculty. (III A.1)

Evidence provided by the Human Resources Office assures that a hiring process is in place. Job announcement, screening committees, HR validation and certification all provide documentation that the college does a thorough job in its efforts to recruit and hire qualified staff. Certified applicants are interviewed. References of recommended applicants are checked by the HR Office and names sent to the President. Then a recommendation is ultimately sent to the Board of Trustees for their approval to appoint the new employee. (III A.1)

The college employs 65% adjunct faculty and is committed to reversing this high percentage. Personnel position caps set by the government of Guam in 2000 are problematic for the college in that the college does not receive fiscal resources to add additional permanent faculty without the approval of the government. The college determines its human resource needs through college assessment but does not have the resources to add positions. Subsequent to an early retirement incentive mandated by the government in 1999, Guam Community College lost key faculty, administrators and staff. Full-time staff dropped from 300 to 198. The government reset the cap for Guam Community College at 198. The college struggles to provide all required services due to the lower cap. College support staff is insufficient as is fulltime faculty to serve all its needs and services. (III A.2)

The college Diversity Policy is complemented by an affirmative action plan. The affirmative action plan was updated recently to reflect the diversity of Guam. (III A.4)

#### **Conclusions**

Guam Community College meets the Standard III.A. Evidence is available to validate the hiring process, the evaluation process and staff development opportunities. Procedures to integrate the HR planning with institutional planning are beginning to be implemented.

## **B.** Physical Resources

## **General Observations**

The College is to be commended for beginning the process of creating a new master plan to replace the outdated one. This is especially important as the college, three years ago, experienced two devastating typhoons, which destroyed buildings but not the spirit of the personnel of Guam Community College. Instead, they rose to the challenge of rebuilding and repairing the damaged facilities. In the new master plan, plans are in place to address the potential student population growth and new programs.

## **Findings and Evidence**

The self-study report, interviews with college administration and staff, and documents show that the college meets the standard in providing physical resources in supporting institutional programs and services. Safety and health are the top priorities for facilities. The college provides sufficient physical resources to support its programs and services by outsourcing its security, grounds, custodial and food services. Outsourced services are not evaluated regularly. (III.B.)

The institution plans and evaluates its facilities and equipment and creates plans based on enrollment data and student needs. For example, one need identified in the master plan and also expressed by the students is the need for a Student Center where students can study, relax, meet friends, and get campus-related information. (III.B.2)

Survey results indicate that facility planning is not an inclusive process with faculty. Faculty input is not regarded when planning for facility resources and capitol projects. Departments hold meetings and prepare reports of their facility needs; however, a college-wide committee does not exist to integrate the facility needs. Through surveys it is evident that a majority of faculty does not believe that their input is regarded when considering development of facility resources and capitol projects in its planning process or about the effectiveness of facilities in regards to supporting student learning outcomes. However, individual faculty members, who are users of a specific capital improvement project, provide information to ensure the connection between instructional needs and physical layout. Projects and renovations to campus facilities and off-campus sites continue as funds become available. Budget constraints have caused the departments to make do with available resources. (III.B.1)

The college has not implemented a continuous cycle with a long range plan for the upgrade and maintenance of facilities which links assessment to student learning outcomes. They have, however, within the constraints of budget cuts and restrictions, been able to construct facilities such as a High Tech Center to address future needs.(III.B.2)

#### **Conclusions**

Guam Community College meets the Standard III.B. Evidence is available that substantiates institutional planning. However, the link between physical resource planning and institutional planning needs to be strengthened.

## C. Technology Resources

#### **General Observations**

The self-study report is clear in addressing this standard. The institution has drafted a technology master plan to address the short-term and long-term technology needs of the college. The draft has been approved through college committees and will be taken to the Board of Trustees for approval. The recently created Technology Advisory Committee will evaluate the technology master-plan on a systematic basis and will set policies that align with assessment and student learning outcomes. The institution has made significant progress with its assessment program and with linking technology to planning.

## **Findings and Evidence**

Technology resources are used to support student learning programs and services and to improve institutional effectiveness. Technology planning is integrated with institutional planning and strategic planning. The integration of planning in these areas is not fully implemented, but the college is very diligently moving forward.

Guam Community College completed many projects to improve institutional technology. They formed a Technology Advisory Committee (TAC) comprised of faculty, staff, and administrators to set policy for technology and to identify college-wide technology infrastructure needs. However, even though the college dedicates resources to technology to address administrative and student needs, the college continues to assess programs in order to tie the draft technology master plan to link planning with student learning outcomes. (III.C.1.)

The college has a plan currently to replace computers and software every 3 to 5 years in some of the student labs. Technology fees are used to fund this replacement program. The institution has a draft technology master plan which will be brought before the Board of Trustees for approval. The plan is an evolving document and will be reviewed and revised to address technology replacement for all programs as needed. Funding the project is a major issue for the college. It is evident that the college seeks funding through grants. The college will take a proposal to the Board of Trustees for approval to increase student fees. The college plans to use some of the student fee increase to fund college-wide technology priorities. (III.C.1)

Guam Community College does not have an integrated institutional software program that integrates administrative and student systems. The college has issued a vendor request for proposal (RFP) for an integrated software system and will form a committee to evaluate vendors and products. After review of available products, the committee will make a recommendation to the college administration and then to the Board of Trustees regarding the purchase of an integrated software system to serve all facets of the college's data needs. (III.C.1).

The TAC will use the process they have established to set policy to communicate required student outcomes throughout the programs offered by the college and to link these outcomes to the technology master plan. Assessment is on-going and the process takes time to fully implement. (III.C.2)

#### Conclusions

Guam Community College meets the Standard III.C as evidenced by interviews and planning documents including the draft technology master plan and the strategic master plan. They have put much effort in developing the draft Technology Master Plan and integrating the plan with the college's Strategic Plan. The lack of adequate and stable funding is a priority that they continue to address with the local government.

## **D.** Financial Resources

## **General Observations**

In general, Guam Community College meets the criteria as set forth in Standard III, Fiscal Resources. The college has made substantial improvements to its fiscal position since the last accreditation study. Funding continues to be unpredictable from the Government of Guam to the college. As Guam continues to slowly recover from the economic downturn of previous years caused by two earthquakes and two typhoons, Guam Community College is stabilizing its budget as well. The College is diligent in seeking funds from Guam Government through annual budget requests.

## Findings and Evidence

The institution relies upon its mission and goals as the foundation for financial planning.

The Guam Community College's mission statement in part states that the college must continue its long history of demonstrated effective management practices, fiscal responsibility, and academic integrity. Annual audit reports receive the highest opinion possible from the college's external auditors. Quarterly fiscal reports are presented to the Board of Trustees. (III.D.1)

Through an institution-wide budget process, campus leaders, including department chairpersons and program managers, and deans participate in the annual budget process. The budgets are department driven; however, there exists a disconnect between the departments of the college. Overall college budgetary needs are not communicated broadly across all staff and departments. At times the lack of communication is in part due to an extremely short timeline set by the government of Guam in the timeframe it sets for the college. For example, in December 2005 the government required that the college submit budget requests within two weeks. Many faculty were on vacation at the time. The normal timeline provides more time for input from the college community. (III.D.1)

The institution continues to take steps to plan for the unpredictability of its funding sources to address institutional priorities. The college has worked closely with the government to address the funding inconsistencies. Guam Community College is proactive with the government and in doing so received additional appropriations to assist in stabilizing funding. Guam Community College has become the model government institution on Guam for fiscal management and accountability. (III.D.2.)

Guam Community College developed a process to manage and track the institutional budget to address early in the budget cycle any potential fiscal challenges.

Financial information is provided throughout the institution. Quarterly financial reports are submitted to the Board of Trustees. While cash flow has been an issue for the institution, additional appropriations from the government have enabled the college to stabilize the cash flow fluctuations. College staff monitor cash on a weekly basis and takes steps to hold back on expenditures temporarily when appropriate.

Revenue from student tuition and fees and auxiliary operations are held in a non-appropriated fund. College budgetary needs that are not met by the GovGuam allocation are prioritized and brought to the Board of Trustees for expenditure approval. A proposed increase to student fees will assist in funding capitol projects. (III.D.2)

The college budgets for the annual debt service on one loan for the new High Tech Building. There are no other long term liabilities. The college has no responsibility to pay for its share of unfunded retirement costs. The Government of Guam has this responsibility. The college, however, discloses this liability annually in its independent audit report. The liability is derived from an actuarial study of post retirement benefits. (III.D.2)

Guam Community College procures property and liability insurance. The college also purchased typhoon insurance through funding from a FEMA grant. (III.D.2)

The college received the highest audit opinion, an unqualified opinion, on its annual external audit for the last several years. (III.D.2)

#### **Conclusions**

Guam Community College has met Standard III.D and done a superb job addressing and dealing with the significant economic challenges of the island and the devastation caused by two typhoons in six months. The financial position of the college is stable. Fiscal resources are severely limited, yet the college maintains fiscal integrity demonstrated through cash flow reports, quarterly fiscal reports, annual audits, and budget to actual reports.

## STANDARD IV LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE

#### **General Observations**

Since the last team visit, the Board has allowed the administration to work in closer collaboration for the betterment of the College. The shift from the College Council to a shared governance model of participation through the Faculty Senate is a sign of progress being made. The college has implemented an assessment process, and the Board and President have expressed commitment to that process and have participated actively.

This Board has made a real difference in providing leadership and direction for the College. Within the last few months, two Board members have been appointed by the Governor and regularly scheduled meetings are now conducted.

Meeting with both the faculty and classified unit representatives established that communication between the units and college administration and Board of Trustees is good. The faculty unit is much more integrated into campus planning and decision making than the classified group. Neither unit voiced any major concern with their access to information and their relationship with administration and the Board.

Leaders of the student organization, COPSA, which included the student member of the Board of Trustees, were very positive about their experience at the college and their access to the president and other leaders. Although student involvement in many of the major plans and decision making efforts is very limited and in some cases nonexistent, as evidenced by the lack of student membership on accreditation teams, student leaders feel that their issues are heard.

## Findings and Evidence

## A. Decision-Making Roles and Processes

The institution is committed to excellence and demonstrates this through its involvement in college-wide assessment. Board members, college administration, faculty, staff, and students that were interviewed all expressed their understanding and commitment to the mission, values, and goals of the college. The newly implemented assessment process provides a means for institutional evaluation and review, planning for improvements, and campus-wide involvement in the decision making processes. (*Institutional Strategic Master Plan; Mission Statement; Board Policy 306*) (IV.A.1, IV.A.2)

While decision-making processes are informal, faculty, staff, administration, and students are encouraged to share their ideas with the college leadership. A shared governance model is being considered. This model creates a role and structure for the Faculty Senate and links the Senate to a proposed Shared Governance Council. If approved by the Board of Trustees, the Council will provide faculty representation. A similar model needs to be

developed for student and classified input into decision making on campus. (March 1, 2006 Faculty Senate Committee Report) (IV.A.3)

Faculty have primary responsibility for curriculum development, identification and assessment of student learning outcomes, program and course improvement. Currently, the administration and Board of Trustees rely primarily on the advice of the Academic Affairs Council, a faculty committee, for curriculum recommendations. (Evidence: Faculty Handbook; (Evidence: BOT Policy Manual; Faculty Handbook; ISMP; Interviews with administration and staff) (IV.A.2.b)

The College Affairs Council meets five times each year as a body of the whole. Reports from administrative leaders and committees are provided. In reviewing the minutes of the last two years, the team found an emphasis on reporting, rather than dialogue which would lead to planning or decision-making. Aside from the College Affairs Council, no formal governance structures are in place at this time. Informal processes of communication and dialogue exist between the administration and various constituencies. (College Affairs Council minutes; Interviews; Shared Governance Model) (IV.A.3)

The previous accreditation self-study, the current accreditation self-study, the interim report, and the reports on substantive changes provide evidence that the institution complies with Accrediting Commission standards, policies, and guidelines. The college responded in an exemplary manner to the recommendations from the previous accreditation report. In addition, the college is in compliance with U.S. Department of Education regulations for vocational funding. (Mid-term report; Correspondence with AACJC; VTEA Plan; Classroom visitations) (IV.A.4)

The Board of Trustees, administrators, and the Foundation participated in assessment of their function and roles. These assessments are available on the assessment website and through the Office of Assessment. The President and Board of Trustees discussed their assessments with the college and indicated that the process was helpful to them. How these assessment tools improve the governess processes is unclear. (BOT First Assessment Report; BOT Second Assessment Report; President's First Assessment Report; President's Second Assessment Report; Interviews with BOT; President) (IV.A.5)

## **B.** Board and Administrative Organization

The Board of Trustees has a policy manual; however, the effective date of many of the policies indicates that they have not been reviewed and/or updated in many years. Board Policy 100 adopted the mission statement. Board Policy 306 established the assessment process now being used to assure the quality, integrity, and effectiveness of student learning programs and services. Board Policy 455 outlines the selection process for the College President. Board Policy 288 and various Board resolutions direct the president to act to address financial crises and/or issues. (IV.B.1, IV.B.1.a, IV.B.1.b)

Members of the governing board are appointed by the governor of Guam and confirmed by the legislature. The positions are reserved for public, business and industry, labor, and student representation. At least two members must be women. The appointment process has resulted in an incomplete board for some period of time. The team found evidence of this in the number of meetings that had to be canceled due to lack of quorum. A full board is now in place. (IV.B.1.d)

As an independent board, actions are final and not subject to the action of any other entity. Policies consistent with the mission statement are adopted, as evidenced by Policy 306 and Policy 100. (IV.B.1.b)

The Board Polices and By-laws are made public in the Board Policy Manual. Board resolutions are consistent with Board policy. New board members bring increased energy, enthusiasm, and commitment. Board policies need to be reviewed on a routine basis to ensure currency and appropriateness of the policy.

New board members were informally oriented as to the function and operation of the Board. The Board recognizes the need for more formal board development activities and training. The comment was made that the lack of funding has hampered training, but Board members realized the importance of the training and especially for new members. The Board did not indicate strong knowledge of student learning outcomes and assessment and its relationship to accreditation. (Interview with Board) (IV.B.1.f)

Board Policy 306 established the assessment process, in which the Board participates. The Board has assessed itself on a regular basis since the policy was approved. Board assessments are recorded in two volumes and are available for public review. (Board of Trustees First Assessment Report January 2003; Board of Trustees Second Assessment Report December 2005). The Board has adopted a code of ethics, Board Policy 115, dated December 1994. (IV.B.1.g)

The Board approved the accreditation self-study; however, members of the Board did not seem to be well versed on the Commission standards and were not directly involved in the development of the study, other than the sign-off of the documents. The Board conducted its own self-assessment as part of the overall college assessment process, which it set in motion by adopting Policy 306. (IV.B.1.i, IV.B.1.g)

The Board understands its role as policymakers working as a whole to support the institution. The team reviewed the written Board policies that describe the process to be used to search, select, and delegate authority to the college president. The president has been evaluated utilizing a survey twice in his six-year tenure, as recorded in the *President's First Evaluation Survey Report* in July 2001 and *Assessing Our President: Second President's Evaluation Report*, which was dated August 2005. The evaluations included an opinion survey that was completed by all constituencies. At the president's request, the assessment outcomes were made public. Both published reports are very positive concerning the president's leadership.

#### **Conclusions**

The college has a Board and a president that are working together collegially. Both have a strong commitment to work together for the betterment of the college. The Board and president have shown their commitment to the new assessment process by participating directly in their own assessment and by funding the TracDat system. The new spirit was evident in talking with other constituencies around campus.

The Board has not had the opportunity for formal training due to limited funding. Board policies are in need of review and updating to meet the challenges of the institution. The move toward formalizing shared governance processes is commendable, and the team sees this vehicle as one of the critical paths to advance the college.

The dialogue between the Board and the president is open, supportive, and aligned with the college mission. The public has access to the Board and is able to communicate concerns. The president's style is to use one-on-one dialogue in communicating with the constituents on campus. More formal and traditional models of communication are now being established in support of shared governance.

The new assessment process, which the Board approved, is built around student learning outcomes. While the Board members were not conversant on the specifics of student learning outcomes, they are committed and supportive of the work the college has begun. The president is fully aware and supportive of the effort.

The Board adopted the mission statement. Members of the Board expressed their commitment to the college mission and their support of the current efforts toward continuous improvement. The president echoed the same commitment to the mission and to the improvement processes the college has begun through its ongoing student learning outcome assessment efforts.

The Board has demonstrated its support and commitment to the ongoing and systematic cycle of evaluation, integrated planning, implementation, and re-evaluation by adopting a Board Policy to ensure that assessment is in place. Moreover, the Board participated in its own evaluation processes, as part of the improvement assessment. The president, likewise, led the way by making public his own evaluation in order to encourage ongoing assessment efforts.

The Board and president funded the TracDat system, which is the organizing tool for defining student learning, providing programs to support that learning, and evaluating how well learning is occurring.

The Board and president are open and forthright regarding the conditions and future of the college. Financial exigencies, facility challenges, environmental issues—these are examples of the hard conversations that the Board and president openly acknowledge and engage.

## Recommendations

- 2 The college is considering a more formal organization for faculty participation in shared governance such as the initiation of a faculty senate. The college should finish its work on developing a formal system for faculty, staff, and student participation in the governance processes of the college. Such systems should provide clear lines of communication and contribute to timely decision making oriented toward the positive development of the institution. (Standards IV.A.1, IV.A.2, IV.A.2.a, IV.A.3)
- 4 The Board of Trustees is now fully empanelled and evidences a commitment to further the development of the college. Provision should be made to provide training for the Board to assist them in fulfilling this commitment. After the Board adopts its recently revised manual, it should engage in a review of Board policies. (Standards IV.B.1.e, IV.B.1.f, IV.B.1.g)